

# **KINGS LAW REPORTS (ALL SC)**

**(1995) 4 KLR PART 30 pp. 707 - 996**  
**APRIL 1995**

Chief Editor

**O. O. Noel Esq.** (Barrister & Solicitor)

## **DEDICATED TO:**

The King of kings

All lovers of Justice

All that thirst after current knowledge of the Law

## **INDEX OF CASES REPORTED**

- |   |        |
|---|--------|
| 1. Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe  | p. 707 |
| 2. J.A. Obonor & Co Ltd. v. Co-operate Bank | p. 765 |
| 3. Kwaghshir v. The State                   | p .    |
| 77  |        |
| 4. Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd.              | p .    |
| 796   |        |
| 5. Ogunjumo v. Ademolu                      | p .    |
| 813   |        |
| 6. Ejionwu v. The State                     |        |
| p. 829                                      |        |

ii INDEX OF CASES REPORTED IN (1995) 4 KLR

|   |         |
|---|---------|
| 7. Iyalabani Co. Ltd v. Bank of Baroda              | p. 840  |
| 8. Ezeanya v. Okeke                                 | p . 847 |
| 9. Iroegbu v. Okwordu                               | p . 877 |
| 10. Paul v. Ozokpo                                  | p . 893 |
| 11. Union Bank of Nigeria Ltd. v. Nwaokolo          | p. 919  |
| 12. Funduk Engineering Ltd. v. McArthur             | p . 944 |
| 13. Jallco Ltd. v. Owoniboy Technical Services Ltd. | p. 959  |
| 14. Onyegbu v. The State                            | p . 978 |

SUPREME COURT JUSTICES

Hon. Justice Mohammed Bello CJN  
Hon. Justice Muhammadu Lawal Uwais  
Hon. Justice Adolphus Karibi - Whyte  
Hon. Justice Salihu Modibbo Alfa Belgore  
Hon. Justice Abubakar Bashir Wali  
Hon. Justice Idris Legbo Kutigi  
Hon. Justice Michael Ekundayo Ogundare  
Hon. Justice Emmanuel Obioma Ogwuegbu  
Hon. Justice Uthman Mohammed  
Hon. Justice Yekini Olayiwola Adio  
Hon. Justice Anthony Ikechukwu Iguh

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1995) 4 KLR iii

APPEALS - Issue - That does not flow from any of the grounds of appeal - Whether to be struck out. Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboy Tech Services Ltd p. 959

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Company Law - Rejection of appellant's case - That its director that signed a mortgage was mentally unsound - Whether Supreme Court will interfere J.A. Obanor & Co. Ltd v. Co-operative Bank p. 765

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Culpable homicide - Where lower courts verdict of guilty - Was based on wrongful evaluation of evidence - T'he basis exists for Supreme Courts interference. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

APPEALS - Findings of trial court - As to applicable customary law- Where faultless and fully supported by evidence - Whether appellate court would interfere. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

APPEALS - Issues for determination - Academic and speculative issue that does not arise - Whether to be determined. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

APPEALS - Error of law - By the Court of appeal- In substituting its findings for those of the trial court Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

APPEALS - Extension of time to appeal- Explanation of the delay is required - Where the delay is Counsel's fault - Whether the party will be punished for the mistake of his counsel. Iyalabani Co. Ltd v. Bank of Baroda p. 840

APPEALS - Extension of time to appeal - Where the proposed grounds of appeal disclose arguable issues - The question whether the appeal will succeed - Is not to be considered at that stage. Iyalabani Co. Ltd v. Bank of Baroda p. 840

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Where supported by evidence - And not shown to be perverse - Whether to be upheld. Ogunjumo v. Ademolu p. 813

APPEALS - Issue - That is incompetent for not being covered by any ground - Is to be struck out. Ogunjumo v. Ademolu p. 813

APPEALS - Grounds of appeal- Failure to consider some of them by the Court of Appeal - Whether a denial of fair hearing. U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo p. 919

BANKING - Guaranteeing bank loan - Where guarantor did not terminate the guarantee properly - Mere payment of a higher amount into that account - Cannot discharge the guarantor. U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo p. 919

COMPANY LAW - Liability for loan advanced to a company - Assuming the signatory to the mortgage had been removed as a director - But the loan paid into the company's account was used for its business - Whether the Company is liable. J. A. Obanor & Co. Ltd v. Co-operative Bank p. 765

COMPANY LAW - Loss of goodwill and reputation - Whether a corporate body - Is entitled to be compensated. Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd. p. 796

CONTRACTS - Interest - On the amount due under the parties' contract - Whether to antedate the date of judgment - When there was no agreement between the parties on payment of interest. Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboys Tech. Services Ltd p. 959

COSTS - Purpose - Not meant to be a bonus to the successful party

- Whether cost should be awarded based on sentiments. U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo p. 919

COURTS - Discretion - Of Court of Appeal in granting extension of time to appeal- Whether properly exercised. Iyalabani Co. Ltd v. Bank of Baroda p. 840

COURTS - Findings of trial court - Whether unjustified or wrongly applied. Ejionwu v. The State p. 829

CRIMINAL LAW - Culpable homicide - Right of private defence 5.65 of Penal Code - Where appellant was cut five times before he stabbed deceased - The defence of private defence avails. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

CRIMINAL LAW - Common intention - Culpable homicide - When 1st appellant is not guilty - 2nd appellant cannot be found guilty pursuant to s. 79 of the Penal Code. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Suspect to adduce detailed evidence of where he was - Whether appellant gave detailed information to police - To warrant investigation of the alibi he raised. Onyegbu v. The State p. 978

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Raised by the 2nd appellant - In a charge of culpable homicide - When found to be false. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Failure to investigate alibi - Whether fatal to prosecution's case - Where evidence that negative the defence was adduced. Onyegbu v. The State p. 978

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Murder - Where facts of the case are largely not in dispute \_ Trial Court's failure to believe the appellant upheld. Ejionwu v. The State p. 829

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Culpable homicide - Plea of private defence by appellant \_ Need to compare the evidence on both sides.

vi **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1995) 4 KLR**

Kwaghshirv. The State p. 777

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Culpable homicide - Valid defences that exonerated appellants - Wrongful verdict of guilty by the lower courts - The Supreme Court will interfere. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Corroboration - Sworn evidence of a child - Whether to be corroborated as a matter of law. Onyegbu v. The State p. 978

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Medical evidence - Murder -Sufficient nexus between death of deceased and appellant's act - Whether Medical evidence is essential. Onyegbu v. The State p. 978

DOCUMENTS - Clear and unambiguous agreement - Between the parties - Whether wrongfully interpreted by the two lower courts U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo p. 919

DOCUMENTS - Determination clause - Enshrined within a document - Where clear and unambiguous - Whether recourse can be had to extraneous matters. U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo p.919

EQUITY - Company law - Where a company takes benefit from a loan paid into its account - It cannot deny liability in equity. J. A. Obanor & Co. Ltd v. Co-operative Bank p. 765

EQUITY - Laches and acquiescence defences - Land dispute - Whether the defences were available to respondent. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

EVIDENCE - Standard of proof in civil cases - Uncontested land case - Whether plaintiffs established their case by minimum proof. Ogunjumo v. Ademolu p. 813

EVIDENCE - Competence of a child to testify under oath - In criminal proceedings - Whether the age of PWI imported incapacity - To understand the nature of an oath. Onyegbu v. The State p. 978

**INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1995) 4 KLR** vii

EVIDENCE - Acts of ownership - No evidence adduced - Burden on plaintiff not discharged - Whether the claim for declaration of title should be dismissed. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

EVIDENCE - Inconsistency - Whether there is any inconsistency in the evidence of the plaintiffs - In relation to their claim. Iroegbu v. Okwordu p. 877

EVIDENCE - Previous statement of a witness - Contradiction therein to be established - The statement must be brought to the attention of the witness. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

EVIDENCE - Contradiction - In previous statement of a witness - Where the statement was not admitted for purposes of establishing the contradiction - Whether appellants can rely on that statement - In alleging contradiction. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

EVIDENCE - Discredit - Appellant's confession of stabbing the deceased once - Where supported by the medical report - Evidence of prosecution witnesses to the contrary held discredited. Kwaghshir v. The State p. 777

EVIDENCE - Custom - Appellants' evidence of custom - Where not controverted by the respondents - Whether trial court rightly accepted it. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

EVIDENCE - Proof- Whether an item in plaintiffs claim was proved- When it failed to tender the relevant document. Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboy Tech Services Ltd p. 959

EVIDENCE - Proof - Where respondent proved his assertion - That several amounts due to him were not paid - The onus is on the appellants to prove the contrary. Janco Ltd v. Owoniboy Tech. Services Ltd p. 959

EVIDENCE - Key witnesses - Failure of the defence to call them - Whether fatal to their case *Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboye Tech. Services Ltd* p. 959

EVIDENCE - Unfavourable evidence - Defendants' failure to produce key witnesses - Whether court is entitled to presume - That such evidence would be unfavourable to them. *Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboye Tech. Services Ltd* p. 959

GUARANTEE - Alteration - Document that is merely an invitation to treat - Whether tantamount to an alteration of the guarantee agreement. *U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo* p. 919

GUARANTEE - Continuous guarantee - For a bank loan - As specified within the parties' agreement - Can only be determined as provided within that agreement. *U B N Ltd v. Nwaokolo* p. 919

INTERLOCUTORY INJUNCTIONS - Basis for the grant - 1. to be weighed against need for defendant to be protected against injury. *Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd.* p. 796

INTERLOCUTORY INJUNCTIONS - Substantial issue to be tried - Where established - Whether applicant should also establish entitlement to the claim. *Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd.* p. 796

INTERLOCUTORY INJUNCTIONS - Balance of convenience - Whether established in favour of the applicant *Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd.* p. 796

INTERLOCUTORY INJUNCTIONS - Resolution of conflicts - Need for court to avoid determination - Of the substantive suit. *Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd.* p. 796

INTERLOCUTORY INJUNCTIONS - Damages - Undertaking as to damages - Whether to be secured from the applicant in all cases. *Oduntan v. General Oil Ltd.* p. 796

JUDGMENTS - Interest on judgment debt - Under the relevant *Kwara* State rules of court - Whether properly determined. *Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboye Tech. Services Ltd* p. 959

LAND LAW - Registrable instruments - Where not registered - Are admissible in proof of payment of purchase price - And to prove equitable interest. *Ogunjumo v. Ademolu* p. 813

LAND LAW - Identity of the land in dispute - Claimed by the plaintiffs - Whether established. *Iroegbu v. Okwordu* p. 877

LAND LAW - Laches - Where natural disasters delayed plaintiffs' action - In resisting defendants' act of trespass - Whether plea of laches, acquiescence, and standing by avails. *Iroegbu v. Okwordu* p. 877

LAND LAW - Land Use Act - Customary right of occupancy grant thereunder - Whether defendants are entitled to it - When they were never in exclusive lawful possession. *Iroegbu v. Okwordu* p. 877

LAND LAW - Traditional history evidence - Presented by the plaintiffs - Whether reliable - As concurrently found by the two lower courts. *Iroegbu v. Okwordu* p. 877

LAND LAW - Title - Traditional history and acts of possession by plaintiff - When evidence thereto is found scanty and unreliable. *Ogunjumo v. Ademolu* p. 813

LAND LAW - Uncontroverted claim - As 4th defendant did not contest the claim - Whether plaintiffs are entitled to succeed. Against

**x INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1995) 4 KLR**

him. Ogunjumo v. Ademolu p. 813

LAND LAW - Family land - Finding that it was conveyed by the family head \_ with the approval of the entire family members - Whether supported by evidence. Ogunjumo v. Ademolu p. 813

LAND LAW - Abandoned property - Definition thereof - Whether property in dispute was an abandoned property. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

LAND LAW - Ownership- Not raised by appellant in previous action - Where appellant has paid arrears of rent in line with the magistrate's court's judgment \_ And did not appeal - Whether she can now claim ownership. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

LAND LAW - Traditional history - Evidence thereof in an action for declaration of title - Whether established. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

LAND LAW - Title - Burden is on plaintiff to prove origin of title of his grantor - \_ Where plaintiff's case was highly discredited - The claim should be dismissed. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

LAND LAW - Trespass - Where appellant was not in possession at the relevant time -Whether claim for damages for trespass pass can be maintained. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

LAND LAW - \_ Injunction - failure to establish any right or interest in the land \_ Whether the Court of Appeal rightly set aside trial court's judgment - In dismissing the appellant's claim. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

LAND USE ACT- Governor's consent - Mortgages - s. 22 of the Act - Whether consent must be obtained before the execution of the mortgage deed. Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707

LIMITATION OF ACTIONS - Statute bar - Wrong entries in account

**INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1995) 4 KLR xi**

- Whether time began to run when the entries were made - Or when the respondent became aware of the error. Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboys Tech. Services Ltdp.959

MORTGAGES - Agreement of the parties - To date their long executed mortgage deed -After securing the governor's consent - Whether appellant can approbate and reprobate. Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707

MORTGAGES - Validity - Where parties agreed not to date the mortgap - Until the governor's consent is secured - Whether s. 22 of the Land Use Act is violated - So as to render the mortgage invalid. Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707

MURDER - Provocation or self defence - finding of the lower courts - That there was no evidence to that effect - Further confirmed by the Supreme Court. Ejionwu v. The State p. 829

PLEADINGS - Issue - Not raised in the parties' pleadings - Raised by the Court of Appeal suo motu - Whether prejudicial and in breach of a party's right to fair hearing. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

PLEADINGS - Rule of pleadings - Duty of court is to determine real issues in controversy - Strict application of rule of pleadings - May lead to miscarriage of justice. Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboys Tech. Services Ltd p. 959

RES JUDICATA - Issue - Previous criminal case of assault - Present civil action for declaration of title to land - Whether the issues are the same. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

RES JUDICATA - Identity of the res - Whether the subject matter is the same - In the past criminal and present civil action. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

RES JUDICATA - Parties - In previous criminal proceedings fought in personal capacities - Whether same as parties in the present civil action - Contested in representative capacity. Ezeanya v. Okeke p. 847

STAY OF EXECUTION - Grant or refusal- Is at court's discretion - What a party seeking to set aside the Order must show. Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p. 944

STAY OF EXECUTION - Jurisdiction - Where the issue of jurisdiction is latent or patent - Whether it will make grant of a stay imperative. Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p. 944

STAY OF EXECUTION - Discretion of trial court - In refusing the application - Wrongly - exercised. Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p. 944

STAY OF EXECUTION - Justice of the case - Whether respondents satisfied the court - That a stay would meet justice of their case given the circumstances. Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p. 944

STAY OF EXECUTION - Fair trial - Where denial thereof was established - Whether it is an exceptional circumstance that will attract a stay. Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p. 944

STAY OF EXECUTION - Conditions attached to the order - Where found to be very fair - whether to be disturbed. Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p.944

SUPREME COURT - Conflicting decisions of the Supreme Court - Where the cases are not relevant to the present case - Resolution of the conflict having become merely academic -Is not necessary. Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707

TRESPASS - Forcible entry of premise I-In exercise of mortgagee's right - under the mortgage agreement - Whether tantamount to trespass. Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd, v. Chinukwe p. 707

## **INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES**

Abandoned Property (Custody and Management) Law, No. 8 1969 of Rivers State s.2. Paul v. Ozokpo p. 893

Companies Act 1968 ss. 334,335 Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1979 ss. 22, 33 Ezeanya v. Okeke 1). 847

Court of Appeal Act s. 16 Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboys Tech. Services Ltd p. 959

Court of Appeal Rules 0.3 r.2(4) Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McArthur p. 944

Criminal Procedure Law Cap. 31 laws of Eastern Nigeria, 1963 s.2(1) Onyegbu v. The State p. 978

Evidence Act ss. 125,124, 127 Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707; s. 58(1) Funduk Engineering Ltdv. McArthur p. 944; ss. 34(1)&(2), 54 Ezeanya v. Okeke p.847

High Court Law of Oyo State ss. 9, 10, 14 Funduk Engineering Ltd v. McAnhur p. 944

Kenyan Land Ordinance 1948 s. 88 Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707

Kwara State High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules 1975 0,27 r. 8 Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboys Tech. Services Ltd p. 959

Land Use Act 1978 ss. 22,26 Awojugbagbe Light Ind. Ltd. v. Chinukwe p. 707; s. 36 (2) Iroegbu v. Okwordu p. 877

Limitation Decree s. 57(1) Jallco Ltd v. Owoniboys Tech. Services Ltd p. 959

Property and Conveyancing Law of Oyo State ss. 123, 125, 131 Awojugbagbe Light Ind, Ltd. v, Chinukwe p. 707